COUNCIL
ON INTEGRITY
IN RESULTS
REPORTING

STUDENTS FIRST

Standards & Implementation Requirements

As Approved and Adopted
Rev. 2017-09-04

Introduction

This document sets forward the CIRR standards for reporting on employment results for graduates of educational programs. For a summary of these standards and the principles that informed their development, please see the Executive Summary of Standards. A sample outcomes report is also available in a separate document.

CIRR Commitments

Schools reporting under CIRR must meet the following requirements:

1. Publicly release student outcomes on a semi-annual basis under the following schedule:
   a. Graduation and placement data for all cohorts Jan 1 - June 30 will be reported by schools March 1st the following year.
   b. Graduation and placement data for all cohorts July 1 - Dec 31 will be reported by schools September 1st the following year.
2. Obtain annual, third-party verification of the documentation and reporting. The first verified report should be released within 12 months of a school's first CIRR report.
3. Use the canonical placement rate, graduation rate, and median salary (marked in teal in the template in this document) as the most prominent statistics of each kind on the school's website and in advertising.

Producing an Outcomes Report

1. Initial Preparations

Review and duplicate the CIRR Outcomes Report Template spreadsheet. Duplicate all sheets labeled "template" for future reference, then rename the original sheets and clear the data. If school has multiple campuses and/or programs, report separately on each campus and program.

Fill in the white boxes in Section I and Section II of the Cover Sheet. Observe the following requirements:

- The reporting period must be either 1/1-6/30 or 7/1-12/31 of the chosen year.
- Input a Published Course Length in calendar days such that the following statement is true: If a student needs to repeat a module/section prior to meeting the graduation criteria, he or she should not count as graduated in 100% of the program length.
- If the program is self-paced, write "self-paced" in the "course length" field, then replace the section labeled "II. Graduation Data" with the below rows.

2. Build a Student List

2A. Programs with a published length

- Build a list of all cohorts that graduated during the reporting period, and list them along with their graduation and start dates on the Cohort List tab.
- List each student that "enrolled" (see below definition) in any of those classes in the Student List tab.

    - This student list should include all students that originally enrolled in an earlier cohort, then subsequently transferred to a cohort on the list. It should also include all students that originally enrolled in a cohort on the list, then subsequently transferred to a later cohort.
- Update the list of students to reflect which students are “graduates” (see below definition).
- The list should note which students held a prior computer science degree prior to enrolling into the program. (Schools need not report this for 2016 cohorts if they did not collect the information at the time of a student’s enrollment.)

The cover sheet should now accurately report the graduation rate within 100% and 150% of the program length.

2B. Self-paced programs (with variable end-dates chosen by the student)

- Build a list of all students who enrolled 12 months prior to the reporting period's start date until 6 months prior to the reporting period's start date. For students who have multiple start dates (pauses, cancellations then return), use their earliest start date.
- Report the graduation rate by dividing the total number of graduates from the dataset by the total amount of enrollments from the dataset.
- Report the time to graduate as a table by dividing the number of graduates in 6 30-day periods by the total number of students from Step 1.
- Add a row counting the students who graduated after 180 days divided by the total number of students from Step 1.
- Add a row counting the students from Step 1 that are still enrolled as of the reporting end date divided by the total number of students from Step 1.
- Add a row counting the remaining percentage of students (those who did not graduate the program nor are enrolled as of the reporting end date).
- The list should note which students held a prior computer science degree prior to enrolling into the program.

It is recommended that the producer of this list produce notes on how this list was created, such that a second team member could reproduce this student list.

Definition of “enrolled”: All students in a course as of (i) the final date under applicable state regulations on which the school is required to provide the student with a full tuition refund, or (ii) if applicable state regulations do not contain such a requirement, the final date as specified in the school’s published policies on which a student may receive a full tuition refund. The full tuition refund may exclude nominal non-refundable registration fees. Enrolled students do not include students who died, became incarcerated, or were called into active military duty during the course, but the student list should contain documentation supporting that classification. In the case of self-paced programs dealing with students with multiple start dates (who may return after pausing or dropping out) should only be counted using earliest start date.

Definition of “graduate”: All students who received a certificate of completion, or who meet the policies listed in Section II of the school’s report. For all cohorts, beginning with the first cohort following the school’s first CIRR report, the school must clearly publish its requirements for a certificate of completion, and include them as part of their enrollment agreement with students.

3. Assign Outcome Codes and Compute Salary Data

Assigning outcome codes is the bulk of the work in producing an employment report. The subsections of this step cover the process in detail. In summary: review each entry in the

Student List and assign an Outcome Code to that student by reviewing the documentation available for that student.

3.1. Determining Outcome Codes

For each student that will be included in the placement data, run down the below list of outcome codes. If documentary evidence is available to assign that code, according to the Required Documentation in Section 3.2, assign the corresponding outcome code. If documentation is not available and cannot be collected, or if documentary evidence does not meet the requirements in 3.2, move to the next assertion in the table. (This may produce counterintuitive results. For instance, if a staff member recalls a student getting a paid, in-field job -- "1A" outcome code -- but no qualifying documentation can be found or gathered, they may be classified as "4".)

The order of the steps is intentional, and reflects the CIRR process. Students that accept a full-time offer after doing some contract work should be reported as 1A and not 2B. By following the steps in order, the report will reflect that outcome, because 1A comes before 2B in this table. (For the avoidance of doubt: 1C is above 1A in the below table, because any qualifying offer from the school should be reported as such, not as a general full-time hire. 3A is last on the list because it is the default, and should not be assigned if documentation supports another code.)

Schools must account for 100% of their graduates under the following categories.

Outcome Codes				
Step	Category	Outcome	Code	Required Documentation
1	Employed in full-time, paid, in-field positions	Hired by school in-field	1C	Qualifying accepted offer
2		Full-time employee	1A	Qualifying accepted offer
3		Full-time apprenticeship, internship, or contract position	1B	Qualifying accepted offer
4	Employed in other positions	Started a new company or venture after graduation	2A	Graduate attestation
5		Short-term contract or part-time position	2B	Qualifying accepted offer
6		Hired by school out of field	2C	Qualifying accepted offer
7		Out of field	2D	Qualifying accepted offer
8	Not employed	Unemployed and not seeking a job	3B	Graduate attestation
9		Non-reporting	4	Outreach record
10		Unemployed and still seeking a job	3A	No documentation required

3.2. Types of Documentation

"No documentation required" (3A) -- Any graduate may be classified as "Unemployed and still seeking a job", with no further documentation. This is the default categorization for all job seekers when no other outcome code can be supported by required documentation.

"Graduate Attestation" (2A, 3B) -- Graduate states, in writing, the below.

- 2A: Graduate is pursuing entrepreneurship full-time in lieu of searching for a job. The endeavor may be for-profit or not-for-profit.
- 3B: Graduate is not pursuing employment because he or she (a) took the program solely for self-enrichment, (b) has had a medical or family emergency arise post-graduation, (c) is continuing education at another institution, or (d) does not have a visa to work in the country in which took the program. (For the avoidance of

doubt: if a non-visa holder finds work, in or out of the country where they took the program, they would more likely be categorized as another code.)

"Outreach Records" (4) -- Documents establishing that the school attempted to contact the student a minimum of four (4) times through two (2) different means of communication, and the student never responded. This documentation shall include the dates of the attempted contacts and the student's contact information used in those attempts.

"Qualifying Accepted Offer" (1A-C, 2B-D) -- Must meet the common requirements (for all outcome codes) as well as the specific requirements for each outcome code. Use common sense to distinguish between offers from the school and offers that are not from the school.

Common requirements: A Qualifying Accepted Offer is any of (1) a written record from the graduate; (2) a written offer letter or contract, either signed or with oral confirmation that the offer was accepted; or (3) confirmation from an employer, third-party recruiter, or legal, credentialed third-party employment history service together with the name and job title of the point of contact. Any such document must also meet these criteria:

- States either the offer date or start date. (If both are available, use the earlier to compute placement data.)
- States that the offer is paid. (For the avoidance of doubt: exact payment rate is not required to establish a Qualifying Accepted Offer. Unpaid offers do not qualify as offers, and should be reported under a different outcome code.)
- Indicates that the offer was accepted
- Any information sourced verbally must meet the requirements listed in Section 3.3.

(For the avoidance of doubt: a school may source information from LinkedIn or other informal sources, but it must get confirmation by a student or employer -- per 1, 2, or 3 above -- or assign an alternate outcome code. CIRR has specifically decided not to allow LinkedIn as a sole source of documentation.)

Specific requirements: Qualifying Accepted Offers differ in three ways: in-field vs. not-in-field, full-time vs. part-time, and long/medium/short-term. An offer is assumed to be not-in-field, part-time, and short-term unless the below criteria are met.

- In-field: Either of the below.
    - Graduate attests that "the job requires the skills for which the student was trained at the school".
    - The document states a job title that would fall under an in-field classification used by Bureau of Labor Statistics SOC codes. School must have published those SOC codes in its catalogue in advance of the student's enrollment, unless this report covers a period before school's first CIRR report was published.
- Full-time: The document indicates that the job is full-time, or at least 32 hours per week.
- Term: For "long-term", the document indicates that the offer or contract is permanent, at-will, or greater than six months in duration. For "medium-term", the document states that the offer or contract is at least three months in duration. (For the avoidance of doubt: a contract-to-hire arrangement, wherein a contract states a three-month employment, and a potential full-time offer thereafter, would count as "medium-term", until/unless a permanent offer was eventually documented.)

The below table specifies the specific requirements for each documentation code.

Code	Outcome	Specific Requirements		
		In-field?	Full-time?	Term
1A	Full-time employee	Yes	Yes	Long-term
1B	Full-time apprenticeship, internship, or contract position	Yes	Yes	Medium-term
1C	Hired full-time by school in-field	Yes	Yes	Long-term
2B	Short-term contract or part-time position	Yes	Not req'd	Any term
2C	Hired by school out of field	Not req'd	Not req'd	Any term
2D	Out of field	Not req'd	Yes	Long-term

Finalizing steps 3.1-3.2
By now, the spreadsheet should contain an outcome code for each graduate, and an effective outcome date when required. Each outcome code should be verified with the associated documentation requirements, which should be stored per the protocol below. The spreadsheet should compute all outcome rates, at 90 and 180 days after the date of graduation.

Documentation Management Protocol: All Required Documentation used for this report shall be stored electronically in a manner that allows them to be inspected within two (2) business days of request by an authorized party. The recommended practice is to put all documents in one electronic folder (using screenshots to incorporate documents hosted on third-party servers, such as email) and link to those documents from the spreadsheet. The records shall be kept for a period of five (5) years after the student's date of enrollment.

Unless otherwise specified, documentation as required under these standards may be obtained in-person, on the telephone, in writing, or through other electronic means. For information obtained in writing or through other electronic means, the records must contain a digital record of the information.

For information obtained verbally, the records must contain a written statement indicating:
1. The date of the conversation,
2. The school representative or agent who conducted the conversation,
3. The person who provided the information, and if that person is not the student, the person's relation to the student, and
4. The content of the conversation as relates to the data being collected.

3.3 Compute Salary Data
Update the spreadsheet with the compensation information for each graduate with an outcome code of 1A-1C or 2B-2D, using the below table. All salary information must follow these guidelines:

- Salary includes only base compensation. It excludes bonuses, equity, relocation, and any other non-base compensation.
- If a student has held multiple positions during the period between the certificate of completion and the point of inquiry, the school shall use the salary of the position used to determine the student's inclusion in the "Employed in Paid, In-Field Position" Job Attainment Rate for purposes of reporting on salary outcomes.

- If salary information is known, it must be included. If it is not known, select “Not provided”.

Role is:	Rate is:	Select:	Input:
Full-time	Annual salary	“Annual salary”	Annual rate
	Hourly	“Full-time hourly wage”	Hourly wage
Full-time or Part-time	Monthly	“Annual salary”	Monthly rate multiplied by 12
	Project-based	“Full-time hourly wage”	Total contract value, divided by project length*
Part-time	Hourly	“Weekly compensation”	Hourly wage multiplied by hours-per-week
	Weekly	“Weekly compensation”	Weekly rate

* For purposes of determining the hourly rate, it shall be assumed that 1 day of work equals 8 hours, 1 week of work equals 40 hours, and 1 month of work equals 160 hours. Hourly rates must be rounded to the nearest cent, counting one-half cent and over as the next higher cent.

When this process is complete, the cover sheet should compute the salary data and distribution, and the portion of graduates that reported salary data.

4. Additional Student Information

4.1 Job Titles of Graduates

To determine the most frequent job titles of graduates, update the spreadsheet to list the title of the job used in determining a student’s Outcome Codes, if the outcome is employment. The cover sheet should compute the most frequent job titles and the percentage of employed graduates with these titles.

4.2 Prior Degrees

To determine prior computer science degrees held:

1. Update the spreadsheet to mark Yes if a student held any computer science degree upon enrolling or No if not.
    a. Schools must collect this information at time of enrollment / on student applications and retain documentation.
    b. This may be self-reported information provided by the student and need not be independently verified by the school or any third-party verifying a CIRR report.
    c. If this report covers a period before school’s first CIRR report was published and it did not collect prior degree information, it may exclude this section from the report.
2. The total percentage of students marked Yes among all graduates in the spreadsheet will automatically be recorded on the summary page

5. Review

It is recommended that a second staff member (that did not produce the report) confirm all of the following:

- Redo step 2 from this document. The student lists should be identical.
- There are no blank fields in the cover sheet, and all fields in the template (from this document) are included on the cover sheet.
- There are no red cells in the Student List sheet.
- There are no blank "document link" entries in the spreadsheet.
- No red flags from a deep-dive on 25% of graduates, selected randomly, and covering the following checks:
    - The reviewer (or the original author of the report) can access all of the linked documents.
    - No pattern of miscategorization, or documentation that does not meet (in part or in full) the requirements specified in this document.
    - For graduates with no salary data in the report, there is no salary data in the associated documentation.

Advertising Salaries and In-Field Employment Rates

Advertising Salaries

Any advertisement or public communication (except those required by regulatory and licensure reporting) about salaries must be accompanied by a "clear and conspicuous" disclosure of the percentage of all graduates represented by those graduates whose salaries were included in the advertisement. The primary salary number in any advertisement must be the canonical average salary, as defined in the "CIRR Commitments" section of this document.

If the advertising format in a given ad is too small for the disclosure, then salary information may not be advertised.

After the release of school's first cohort report under these standards, a school may not advertise or issue a public communication regarding salaries that includes graduates not covered by a cohort report publicly released under the CIRR standards.

Records for each advertisement or public communication that uses salaries must be kept for which graduates were used to calculate the median salary in accordance with the measurement standard.

Advertising In-Field Employment

For any advertisement or public communication (except those required by regulatory and licensure reporting) that makes a claim about the rate of "in-field" (or equivalent language) employment, the only graduates who may be counted as "in-field" (or equivalent) are those who have met the documentation criteria for Employed Full-Time in Paid, In-Field Positions.

After the release of school's first cohort report under these standards, schools may not advertise or issue a public communication regarding in-field employment that includes graduates not covered by a cohort report publicly released under the CIRR standards.

Records for each advertisement or public communication that uses "in-field" (or equivalent language) employment must be kept for which graduates were used to calculate the rate.

Advertising Graduation Rates

For any advertisement or public communication (except those required by regulatory and licensure reporting) that makes a claim about the graduation rate, for programs with a published program length, the only number that may be used is the percentage of students who graduate within 100% of published program length (on-time); for self-paced programs, the only number that may be used is the total graduation rate as calculated and reported above in section 2B.