

## AI Peer Review Activity

---

This activity will give you experience using ChatGPT and discerning how the artificial intelligence (AI) tool might be helpful in your writing process. You'll use ChatGPT to help you develop your first assignments for class: Advocating Change. By the end of these activities and reflections, you'll achieve the following:

- Compare and contrast human and AI peer feedback on your writing
- Identify ways to improve your writing
- Identify ways to improve your feedback on others' writing
- Identify benefits and potential pitfalls of relying on ChatGPT for feedback

### Step 1: Submit Your Assignment 1 (Brief Reading Deck Report) Draft Outline

Prepare a *detailed* outline of your problem and solution brief reading deck report pages and submit it on [Insert Course Management System] on [Insert Date]. The more detail you provide, the better the feedback you'll receive from ChatGPT and your peers. Include the following:

**Purpose Statement:** For example, *"To persuade the leadership team at Mikella's Restaurant to update the server training program."*

**Audience Analysis:** Provide brief, relevant information about the audience, for example, the primary and secondary decision makers, your relationship with them, their potential reactions to your idea, what they already know, and anything else unique about them that might affect your report. For example, *"The primary decision maker is the general manager, but she will listen to the head server's opinion the most, and the head server is resistant to change. She has confidence in me, but she sees me as a privileged, "know-it-all" student. She has worked only at Mikella's (for 15 years) so knows only this one approach to training."*

**Problem Page:** Identify the problem and the significance to the audience. You can use an outline form for this section by writing out a claim (message title), and then providing a list of evidence for each.

**Solution Page:** Describe your idea for solving the problem and justify your recommendation with evidence. Again, consider using outline form.

Review the criteria in Step 3, below, which you'll input into ChatGPT, to make sure you cover all the points.

### Step 2: Review Two Students' Outlines

Your instructor will assign you as a peer reviewer to two students (one in your class and another student in a different section).

- You will be assigned as a peer reviewer to a peer in class.
- You are to pick up a hard copy of your peer review and your anonymous peer review from [Insert Location].

Using the peer review form on Page 4, provide feedback on your peer's draft problem and solution outlines. Prepare to discuss your feedback in class.

You will provide feedback in the same way to a student in another class. This feedback will be anonymous. You are to post your completed peer feedback form on [Insert Course Management System] by **[Insert Date]**.

### Step 3: Ask ChatGPT for Feedback

Sign into ChatGPT and ask for feedback on your draft problem and solution outlines. The best prompt tells ChatGPT what role to play and what to do. For example, you can write, *You are an instructor giving a student feedback on a draft outline for a problem-solving report. You are supportive and give suggestions on what works well and what could be improved. You are not rewriting for the student. Use the following criteria:*

- *Recommendation is clear in a Purpose Statement.*
- *Audience Analysis is thorough and relevant. Includes both primary and secondary audiences.*
- *Problem is clearly described. Evidence explains the significance to the audience and organization.*
- *Solution is clearly described. Evidence convinces the audience that the recommendation will solve the problem is and worth doing.*
- *Costs/benefits/downsides/obstacles are included to strengthen the argument, but they don't overwhelm the main points.*
- *The organization is logical, with more main points (claims) before evidence.*

*Here's the draft outline: [paste].*

Then copy and paste in your draft. After you get the response, try different prompts to see whether you get different results; continue interacting with ChatGPT. For example, you can ask why it gave you certain feedback or how you can incorporate certain suggestions.

### Step 4: Reflect on Your Experience with ChatGPT

In about 500 words, write your responses to the following questions:

- How helpful was the feedback you received from ChatGPT?
- What, if anything, surprised you about the feedback?
- What additional prompts or follow-up questions deepened the feedback?
- What feedback will you incorporate into your final writing and what will you ignore?
- What are the dangers of interacting with ChatGPT in this way?

Submit your "Reflect on Your Experience with ChatGPT" reflection on [Course Management System] by **[Insert Date]**.

### Step 5: Compare AI and Human Feedback

Print and bring your ChatGPT feedback to class. In class with your partner, take turns reviewing the feedback. Start with one of you and exchange feedback: give your partner the ChatGPT feedback you received, and ask your partner to give you their written feedback on your paper. You will both receive a

copy of the anonymous feedback from a student in another class. Read both papers and then discuss the following questions:

- What differences do you notice between the two students' feedback?
- To what extent, if any, do you attribute the differences to one review being anonymous?
- What differences do you notice between the AI and human feedback?
- As the feedback receiver, which comments were most helpful and why?

Now switch and focus on the other student's work and discuss the same questions.

### **Step 6: Reflect on Peer Feedback**

In about 500 words, address the following questions:

- What did you learn about your writing based on the feedback you received? List and explain at least three ways you will improve your draft.
- What did you learn about giving feedback? List and explain at least three ways you can improve your peer feedback on future assignments.
- Overall, what did you learn from the AI Peer Feedback activities?

Submit your "Reflect on Peer Feedback" on [Insert Course Management System] by **[Insert Date]**.

## Peer Feedback Form

Criteria	Peer Reviewer Comments
Recommendation is clearly described in a Purpose Statement.	
Audience Analysis is thorough and relevant. Includes both primary and secondary audiences.	
Problem is clearly described. Evidence explains the significance to the audience and organization.	
Solution is clearly described. Evidence convinces the audience that the recommendation will solve the problem is and worth doing.	
Costs/benefits/downsides/obstacles are included to strengthen the argument, but they don't overwhelm the main points.	
The organization is logical, with more main points (claims) before evidence.	
<b>General comments for your peer.</b>	